



LIVINGSTON BOARD OF EDUCATION VOTING MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, July 25, 2018

Executive Session – Administrative Building Large Conference Room – 6:00 p.m.

Public Session – Administrative Building Large Conference Room – 7:00 p.m.

A **Voting Meeting** of the Livingston Board of Education was held on this date in the large conference room in the Administration Building. The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by the Board President, Pamela Chirls, who announced that adequate notice of this meeting had been provided by amendment to notice approved at the Board's voting meeting on June 18, 2018 and posted at the Board of Education office and communicated to *The Star Ledger*, *West Essex Tribune*, *The Alternative Press* and the Livingston Township Clerk.

Mr. August moved the following:

Executive Session

Whereas, the Open Public Meetings Act, N.J.S.A. 10:4-11, permits the Board of Education to meet in closed session to discuss certain matters; now, therefore be it

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education adjourns to closed session to discuss:

- Personnel and Legal Settlement

Action may be taken upon return to public session. The full length of the meeting is anticipated to be approximately 60 minutes and be it

Further Resolved, the minutes of this closed session be made public when the need for confidentiality no longer exists.

Mrs. Konner seconded the motion.

Vote all in favor.

Mrs. Chirls reconvened the public meeting at 7:08 p.m.

Members Present: Charles "Buddy" August, Pamela Chirls, Ronnie Konner, Samantha Messer, George Shen and Philippe Jallow

Also in Attendance: Christina Steffner, Steven Robinson, Lisa Capone-Steiger, Susan Burman, Joann Goldberg and approximately 70 members of the public and staff

Superintendent's Report

1. AP Waitlist Update

Mrs. Steffner provided an update on the current number of students who remain on the waitlists for AP courses.

2. Additional State Aid

Mr. Robinson explained we received an additional \$866,126 as our budget had already indicated a \$334,937 increase. Mr. Robinson presented the board with the following three options: 1) increase our budget by the \$866,126 and allocate to an account that we can transfer from during the year based on unforeseen expenses; 2) increase by a portion of the \$866,126 and reduce the tax levy with the remainder; or 3) reduce the tax levy by \$866,126. Mr. Robinson recommended option 1 but asked the board to provide him with their opinions within the next couple of weeks.

The board supported Mr. Robinson's recommendation of option 1. Mr. Robinson will come back to the board at a future meeting with a change in the budget.

3. Resignation

Mrs. Steffner read a statement that she will be resigning from the district as of July 31, 2018. Mrs. Steffner thanked the talented staff for their support during her tenure here.

Mrs. Chirls opened up public input.

Public Input on Agenda Items ~ up to 15 minutes

Anthony Rosamilia, President of Livingston Education Association, thanked Mrs. Steffner for her service and wished her well in her future endeavors.

Stephanie Cohen, 20 Stonewall Drive, stated there is an unofficial site on Facebook that is deliberately intended to mislead parents. Mrs. Cohen asked why a board member on the site has never responded to this false information and asked how the page got confidential information about tonight's meeting before the public.

Ilyse Shainbrown, 2 Mountain Ridge Drive, provided a list of 150 names in support of Mrs. Steffner staying. Mrs. Shainbrown stated she agrees with the letter PT council read a few meetings back that Mrs. Steffner is a great asset who provides strong leadership.

Laura Goren, 8 Tremont Terrace, stated she is heartbroken to read all of the negativity on Facebook about our dedicated professionals.

Gwen Samuels, 35 Tiffany Drive, read a letter from a friend stating she strongly disagrees with any effort to remove Mrs. Steffner from her position because she moves the district forward and listens to parents. Mrs. Samuels stated she, herself, is disheartened.

Deb Ostrowski, Principal at MPMS and President of LAA, on behalf of the LAA, thanked Mrs. Steffner for her incredible leadership and all she has done to move the district forward. Mrs. Ostrowski wished Mrs. Steffner the best of luck in her future educational endeavors.

Jeff Lichtstein, 46 Heron Road, asked if the board originally asked the superintendent to investigate random student drug testing and if yes, why over the last 12 months of discussions did they not speak up while she was being crucified over the decision. Mr. Lichtstein asked if the

rumor going around that this board has reached out to the State to get approval to fire the superintendent is true. Mr. Lichtstein added he is concerned the decision of some board members is being dictated by a vocal minority.

Ian Shainbrown, 2 Mountain Ridge Drive, stated board members should only be concerned about what is best for the children and asked why they feel now is the appropriate time to make this type of a move.

Lisa Becker, 6 Tulane Drive, thanked Mrs. Steffner for everything she has done for the district and hopes she stays. Mrs. Becker stated the culture of the board needs to change.

Scott Goldman, 42 North Baums, stated policy comes from the board and executive action comes from the superintendent but that appears to be reversed over the past two years. Mr. Goldman stated he feels Mrs. Steffner never respected, listened to or partnered with this community.

James Calderon, 17 Claremont Avenue, congratulated Phillipe on becoming the new student representative and wished Mrs. Steffner well. Mr. Calderon stated the community needs to figure out what kind of leadership and organization they want moving forward and the board should create an organization chart that is beneficial for our children.

Jeff Lichtstein, 46 Heron Road, stated the language Mr. Goldman used was offensive and that the information on social media has been negative. Mr. Lichtstein continued it is okay to disagree with each other and everyone has a right to their own position but the discussions should always be civil, especially on social media.

When public input was closed, Mr. August responded that yes, the board did give Mrs. Steffner the authorization to look into random student drug testing.

Ms. Messer responded that our attorney has expressly advised the board that they should not be on that Facebook page and to her knowledge, four of the five members are not.

Mrs. Chirls responded they were told if there is an informational item to share, that could be shared, and that is the extent to which she has posted.

Board Reports

Mrs. Konner explained the Curriculum Committee met and were provided with a 1:1 update at MPMS, reviewed materials to be approved at an upcoming agenda, discussed the training status for staff teaching AP courses, changes in PARCC testing requirements and the diversity training the district is planning moving forward.

Mrs. Steiger reviewed the Crayola training program staff engaged in last week. This program showed the leadership team how to infuse art across the curriculum.

Mr. Shen explained the Finance and Facilities Committee met and discussed creating a path to get to all of the tennis courts at Heritage and the status of the LHS turf field.

Mr. Shen also attended the Diversity Committee meeting and announced that August 7 is National Night Out and that September 29 is a full town wide event celebrating the diversity of our community.

Approval of Minutes

The Executive Session minutes have been tabled until the August 15 meeting.

Mr. August moved the following:

1. Voting Meeting Minutes of July 10, 2018

Mr. August seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Mr. Shen, Mrs. Chirls
Nays - None

Public Input on Agenda Items ~ up to 15 minutes

Ms. Messer asked that the minutes reflect that the full agenda of this meeting was not made available to the public online prior to the meeting when there are items on this agenda that the board will be voting on.

Rachel Selvin, 18 Canoe Brook Drive, asked what the succession plan is to replace the superintendent and what will it cost the taxpayers to make this change. Mrs. Selvin also repeated the question about the rumor that a petition had been made to the State because it was not answered.

Sudeep Amin, 6 Washington Court, stated he is shocked by what is happening here tonight and that sometimes the voice of the vocal minority does not represent the voice of the community as a whole. Mr. Amin added that this is a lesson for the community to be more engaged so they don't only come out when they need to react to events that are happening. Mr. Amin thanked Mrs. Steffner for all that she is done and for having respectful conversations even when there were disagreements.

Stephanie Cohen, 20 Stonewall Drive, as a member of PT Council, thanked Mrs. Steffner for being the first person to actually listen to and make their requests happen and for all she has done for the children in Livingston. Mrs. Cohen stated she is so very sorry to see Mrs. Steffner leave.

Frank Cherichello, 33 Wellington Road, suggested to fix things going forward, for the board to open up and ask the community to be involved in the search for the next superintendent.

Julie Kaplan, 31 Mountain Ridge Drive, thanked Mrs. Steffner for everything she has done for Livingston. Mrs. Kaplan requested the board not vote on this tonight so that more of the community could be made aware and have the opportunity to come out.

Mahnaz Shirazi Whang, 94 Sykes Avenue, stated she is disappointed that she didn't know about the superintendent's resignation until she came into the meeting tonight and that there was absolutely no transparency about this for the public. Mrs. Whang wished Mrs. Steffner luck in her future endeavors.

Todd Goren, 8 Tremont Terrace, asked for an explanation of board policy for public notice of agenda items.

Mr. Robinson explained there are times when personnel items are walked into a meeting and agrees this a big personnel item; however, this is not an uncommon practice.

Mrs. Chirls added this is a personnel issue that is confidential so we cannot share any more with the public.

Ian Shainbrown, 2 Mountain Ridge Drive, stated the question was why there was no public notice given especially that this is something that affects everyone.

Mrs. Chirls acknowledged this is a walk in item and that we have done it before.

Mr. Shainbrown asked if the board thinks it is appropriate to vote on something of this significant magnitude without providing public notice.

Mrs. Chirls responded at this time, yes.

Mrs. Cohen asked if the board petitioned the State to have Mrs. Steffner removed and Mrs. Chirls responded there was no petition; however, it is a confidential matter that they cannot discuss.

Mr. Shainbrown asked if the board has an explanation about why they think it is appropriate to vote on this tonight and what is the urgency. Mrs. Chirls responded it is not unusual to have a walk in item.

Mrs. Cohen stated they want answers because this affects their children.

Mrs. Chirls apologized that she cannot answer these questions.

Ms. Messer stated she does not believe it is appropriate and that this board is looking to schedule another public voting meeting on either July 30 or July 31 and clarified that there would be another opportunity to vote on this matter.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR APPROVAL

PROGRAM/CURRICULUM

There was no action.

STUDENT SERVICES

Mr. August moved the following:

2.1 Out of District Placements

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves placement for the academic year 2018-2019 for one (1) Livingston student with disabilities and for Extended School Year 2018 (Summer Programs) for one (1) Livingston student with disabilities, as classified and recommended by the Child Study Team, in facilities with tuition costs to be determined within the limits established by the New Jersey Board of Education as shown on ***Attachment A***.

2.2 Related Services/Medical Consultants

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following consultants that will be utilized to provide related services for the 2018-2019 school year:

OCCUPATIONAL THERAPIST

CPNJ

\$120/hour

Mrs. Konner seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Mr. Shen, Mrs. Chirls
 Nays - None

BUSINESS

Mr. Robinson announced we will be tabling 3.8, Policies and Regulations, and will be adding walk in item 3.9, Additional Board Meeting. Mr. Robinson continued we will be holding a Special Voting Meeting on Monday, July 30, 2018.

Ms. Messer moved 3.1 to 3.7 and 3.9:

3.1 Payment of Bills

Whereas, the Board Secretary has audited certain vendor claims as required by N.J.S.A. 18A:19-2 and Board Policy 6470 and presented them to the Livingston Board of Education with the recommendation they be paid, now therefore be it

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the payment of the following bills in the amounts listed and attach a complete copy of these bills to the minutes of this meeting.

Fund	Name	Amount
10&11	Regular	\$1,611,912.47
12	Regular	316,074.05
20	Regular	346,233.65
60	Cafeteria	647,078.51
	TOTAL	<u>\$2,921,298.68</u>

Regular Checks	76672-77175	\$2,274,220.17
Cafeteria Checks	1045-1051	647,078.51
	TOTAL	<u>\$2,921,298.68</u>

3.2 Board Secretary Report – May 2018

Whereas, the Livingston Board of Education has received the Report of the Board Secretary for May 31, 2018, consisting of:

- 1) Interim Balance Sheets
- 2) Interim Statements Comparing Budgeted Revenue with Actual to Date and Appropriations with Expenditures and Encumbrances to Date
- 3) Schedule of Revenues - Actual Compared with Estimated
- 4) Statement of Appropriations Compared with Expenditures and encumbrances, and

Whereas, the Livingston Board of Education has received the report of the Treasurer for May 31, 2018, which report is in agreement with the Report of the Board Secretary, and

Whereas, these reports show the following balances on the date indicated:

	Cash Balance	Appropriation Balance	Fund Balance
(10) General Current Exp. Fund	5,918,379	17,893	
(11) Current Expense		1,636,730	3,540,783

(12) Capital Outlay		94,261	3,178,235
(20) Special Revenue Fund			
(30) Capital Projects Fund	3,131,787		
(40) Debt Service Fund			
Total:	\$9,050,166	\$1,748,884	\$6,719,018

Whereas, pursuant to N.J.A.C. 6:20-212(d), the Board Secretary has certified that as of May 31, 2018, no budgetary line item account has obligations and payments contractual orders which in total exceed the amount appropriated by the district board of education pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:22-8, 18A:22-8.1, now therefore be it

Resolved, the Livingston Board of Education accepts the above referenced reports and certification and directs that they be made part of this resolution by reference, and be it

Further Resolved, the Livingston Board of Education certifies that, after review of the Secretary's monthly financial report (appropriations section) and upon consultation with the appropriate district officials, to the best of its knowledge no major account or fund has been over-expended in violation of N.J.A.C.6:20-2.13(d) and that sufficient funds are available to meet the district's financial obligations for the remainder of the fiscal year.

3.3 Transfers

Whereas, the Superintendent of Schools recommends certain transfers among accounts in the 2017-2018 budget for May pursuant to Board of Education Policy 6422, now therefore be it

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education ratify transfers pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:22-8.1 and N.J.A.C. 6:20-2A.10:

<u>Object</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>To</u>	<u>From</u>
0100	Salaries	\$375,743	
0242	Other Retirement Contributions	\$17,000	
0260	Workmen's Compensation		\$38,200
0270	Health Benefits		\$402,245
0320	Purch Prof-Educational Services	\$13,000	
0390	Other Purch Pro/Tech		\$1,800
0420	Clean/Repair Maintenance		\$2,000
0490	Other Purch Prop Serv	\$4,000	
0500	Other Purchased Serv		\$11,000
0503	Aid in Lieu Payments	\$1,502	
0512	Cont. Services (Other)	\$25,000	
0514	Cont Services (Sped)	\$53,000	
0562	Tuition other LEA Spec	\$5,000	
0566	Tuition Pri Scl Handicapped	\$5,000	
0600	Supplies and Materials		\$39,000
0610	General Supplies		\$5,000
	TOTALS	\$499,245	\$499,245

3.4 Approval of Property, Liability and Workers Compensation Insurance for 2018-2019

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education awards the property and liability insurance policies to:

<u>New Jersey School Boards Association Insurance Group</u>		
Brown and Brown Insurance (Broker)		
Comprehensive Board Program Property, General Liability, Auto Coverage, Crime Coverage, Pollution Liability, Excess Liability Insurance	(7/1/18-7/1/19)	\$289,435.00
<u>New Jersey School Boards Association Insurance Group</u>		
Brown and Brown Insurance (Broker)		
School Board Legal Liability	(7/1/18-7/1/19)	\$149,613.00
<u>New Jersey Unshared Excess Program (NJUEP)</u>		
Brown and Brown Insurance (Broker)		
Excess Liability - \$24 million	(7/1/18-7/1/19)	\$ 20,636.00
<u>Monarch</u>		
Brown and Brown Insurance (Broker)		
Volunteer Accident Policy	(7/1/18-7/1/19)	\$753.00
<u>CNA Surety</u>		
Brown and Brown Insurance (Broker)		
Bond-Board Secretary/Treasurer	(7/1/18-7/1/19)	\$1,600.00
<u>Monarch</u>		
Brown and Brown Insurance (Broker)		
Student/Athletic Insurance	(7/1/18-7/1/19)	\$44,076.00
<u>New Jersey School Boards Association Insurance Group</u>		
Brown and Brown Insurance (Broker)		
Workers Compensation & Supplemental Indemnity	(7/1/18-7/1/19)	\$473,032.00
TOTAL INSURANCE COST		<u>\$979,145.00</u>

3.5 Change Order

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following change order that has been approved by the architect and construction manager:

DiMilia, Inc. – HMS Tennis Court Construction		
Original Contract		\$415,777.00
Previously approved change orders		<u>0</u>
Contract sum prior to additional change orders		\$415,777.00
Change Order #1 – Create an access path to the new tennis court complex.		\$24,330.00
New Contract Sum		\$440,107.00

3.6 Conferences and Overnight Trips

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the conferences and overnight trips as shown on **Attachment B**.

3.7 Settlement Agreement

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the Settlement Agreement for Case #05-18 which is on file at the Board of Education office.

3.9 Additional Board Meeting

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the addition of a Special Voting Meeting on Monday, July 30, 2018.

Mrs. Konner seconded the motion.

Mr. Robinson explained the change order is to put a five foot sidewalk in to connect the tennis courts together at HMS.

Ms. Messer stated she had the opportunity to look through the legal bills and sees a substantive amount of line items being charged to the board because we have reached out to the attorney and is personally not aware of the content of these discussions nor has she received the entirety of the work product so she is unsure how to vote.

Mr. Robinson explained all legal bills are reviewed and signed off by the administrative team before they are placed on the bill list for payment.

Mrs. Konner confirmed the bill list is reviewed by the Finance and Facilities Committee prior to the voting meeting.

ROLL CALL VOTE – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer (abstain from Sciarrillo law bills), Mr. Shen, Mrs. Chirls
Nays - None

PERSONNEL

Mrs. Konner made a motion for 4.1 through 4.9 with the addition of walk in items 4.1a and 4.10:

Ms. Messer requested 4.1a and 4.10 be voted upon separately.

July 25, 2018

Mrs. Konner agreed to amend the motion for 4.1 through 4.9:

4.1 Resignations

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education accepts the resignations of:

Name	Position	Reason	Location	Last Day of Employment
<i>Julie Nersesian</i>	Teacher of Social Studies	Retirement	MPMS	June 30, 2018
<i>Laura Kirkpatrick</i>	TOSD	Resignation	MPMS	June 30, 2018
<i>Ryleigh Honig</i>	Instructional Aide	Resignation	Collins	June 30, 2018
<i>Cara Pelchat</i>	School Counselor	Resignation	LHS	September 18, 2018 or earlier if a replacement can be found
<i>Adaliana Cuadrado</i>	Support Staff	Resignation	CO	August 3, 2018

4.2 Leaves of Absences

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the leaves of absences of:

Name	Position	Location	LOA w/pay and benefits	LOA w/o pay, but with benefits (if applicable)	Extended LOA w/o pay or benefits	Return Date
<i>Michele Green*</i>	Elementary School Teacher	Harrison	1/17/18-4/27/18	4/30/18-5/3/18 & 5/4/18-10/3/18**	10/4/18-10/31/18	11/1/18

**as amended from a previous agenda*

***Designates time counted toward NJFLA/FMLA*

4.3 Transfers

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the transfers as listed on **Attachment C**.

4.4 Appointments

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the applications indicated below (*) for emergent hiring for the following appointments under the requirements of N.J.S.A. 18A:16-1 et. seq., N.J.S.A. 18A:39.17 et. seq.; N.J.S.A. 18A:6-4.13 et. seq. All appointments are contingent upon reference checks in accordance with P.L. 2018, c.5.

Name	Location	Title	Tenure Track/LOA or LT Replacement	Replacing	Guide	Step	Salary	Effective Date
<i>Kristen Markey-Skeffington</i>	MPMS	School Psychologist	First Year Tenure Track	Dr. Nancy Petryna (transfer)	MA+32	5	\$68,523	8/29/18

<i>Alyssa Lee</i>	Hillside	Elementary School Teacher	One Year Leave Replacement	Kristen Murray	BA	1	\$52,515	8/29/18
<i>Lauren Bernstein</i>	BHE	TOSD	First Year Tenure Track	Mary Smith (transfer)	BA+32	3	\$58,163	8/29/18
<i>Dulcie von Ameln</i>	Collins	Elementary School Teacher	Leave Replacement	Stephanie Robinson	BA	1	\$52,515	8/29/18
<i>Michelle Carroll</i>	HMS	Teacher of Math	First Year Tenure Track	Samantha Weisberg	MA	8	\$67,948	8/29/18
<i>Thomas Montesion</i>	MPMS	Teacher of Social Studies	First Year Tenure Track	Julie Nersesian	BA	1	\$52,515	8/29/18
<i>Allison Tallman</i>	Hillside	Reading Specialist	One Year Leave Replacement	Lauren Szaro	MA+32	1	\$65,326	8/29/18
<i>Ellen O'Connor</i>	CO	Applications Architect	NA	New position	NA	NA	\$73,000 (pro-rated)	9/25/18 or earlier if released from current contract
<i>Jessica Byrne</i>	CO	12-month office Support	Eligible for tenure	Adalana Cuadrado	12-month OS FT >7/12	4	\$50,482, plus \$1,200 degree	8/1/18
<i>Annette Ferreira</i>	BHE	First Secretary	Tenured	Jessica Byrne	10-month 1 st Secy >7/12	11	\$53,838	9/1/18
<i>Richard Porfido**</i>	LHS	Athletic Director	First Year Tenure Track	David Cohen	LHS-AP	12	\$137,467	8/7/18

**as amended from previous agenda

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the appointment of the ABA Discrete Trial TA's and Instructional Aides as listed on ***Attachment D***.

4.5 Extra Work Pay

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following payments as listed on ***Attachment E*** for work performed.

4.6 Stipends

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the Livingston High School Athletic Stipends as listed on ***Attachment F***.

4.7 Summer Work

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves all Livingston Public Schools Related Service Providers to work over the summer on an as needed basis, by request or with prior approval of the Assistant Superintendent, at their 2018-2019 hourly rates.

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the individuals listed on ***Attachment G*** for Extended School Year (ESY) staffing at the listed hourly rates.

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves *Giovanna McCorkell*, Teacher of Math at LHS, to teach Math Enrichment from July 30 – August 2, 2018 from 8:30 – 11:30 a.m., at a rate of \$60.00/hour, not to exceed 12 hours.

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves *Meghan Reid*, Teacher of English, to teach ELA Enrichment from August 27 & 28, 2018 from 8:30 a.m. – 3:00 p.m., at a rate of \$60.00/hour, not to exceed 6 hours.

4.8 Memorandum of Understanding

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the MOU between the LBOE and the LEA dated July 25, 2018.

4.9 Contract Changes

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the contract changes on ***Attachment H***.

Mr. August seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Mr. Shen, Mrs. Chirls
Nays - None

Mrs. Konner moved the 4.1a and 4.10:

Ms. Messer requested the two motions be voted upon separately.

Mrs. Konner amended the motion to move 4.1a:

4.1a Resignations (additional)

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the resignation of Christina Steffner as Superintendent of Schools effective July 31, 2018.

Mr. August seconded the motion.

Ms. Messer provided a PowerPoint to honor Mrs. Steffner and wished her success in her future endeavors.

Mr. Shen stated he appreciates Mrs. Steffner's dedication and wished her the best.

ROLL CALL VOTE – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Konner, Mrs. Chirls
Nays – Ms. Messer, Mr. Shen

Mrs. Konner moved 4.10:

4.10 Separation of Service Agreement

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves a Separation of Service Agreement between it and Employee # 7212 effective July 31, 2018. The Separation of Service Agreement received the prior approval of the Commissioner of Education.

Mr. August seconded the motion.

Ms. Messer stated she does not support the separation agreement as this leaves us with a leadership void in the weeks before we head back to school and as of earlier today, no conversations about a succession plan had been discussed. Ms. Messer feels decisions of this magnitude deserve more discussion time.

ROLL CALL VOTE – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Konner, Mrs. Chirls
Nays – Ms. Messer, Mr. Shen

Public Comment ~ up to 15 minutes

Rachel Selvin, 18 Canoe Brook Drive, expressed disappointment with the decision of this board this evening and thanked Mrs. Steffner for her leadership.

James Calderon, 17 Claremont Avenue, asked about monitoring students taking more than one AP class and asked about the treasurer reporting to the Business Administrator.

Elyse Shainbrown, 2 Mountain Ridge Drive, stated the board did a disservice to the students and told Mrs. Steffner she will miss her.

Ian Shainbrown, 2 Mountain Ridge, Drive, asked how the three board members who voted yes, as parents, could do this to the students.

Scott Goldman, 42 North Baums Court, stated the salary cap caused us to have excess turnover, not the Board of Education and there is nothing a board can do if the superintendent elects to resign. Mr. Goldman stated we should move forward as a proud community.

Kim Ratner, 38 Westmount Drive, stated parents have confidence that the people they vote in are working together as a team and doesn't understand why select members of the board want to push her out. Mrs. Ratner thanked Mrs. Steffner for putting the district back on track and stated board members have lost her vote.

Mahnaz Shirazi Whang, 94 Sykes Avenue, is still concerned about the number of the incoming kindergarten classes at Harrison.

Stephanie Cohen, 20 Stonewall Drive, asked if something could be done about the Facebook page to make sure people understand they are receiving information that is not sanctioned by the board. Mrs. Cohen added a photo of one of our buses was used on one of the sites.

Greg Drucks, Juvenile Detective of the Police Department, spoke highly of Mrs. Steffner adding it is a shame she is leaving.

Debbie Rosenthal, 1 Locust Place, thanked Mrs. Steffner for her professionalism and expressed her concern about the enrollment of the incoming kindergarten class at Harrison. Mrs. Rosenthal asked if we could add a fourth class.

Janine Ferdinand, 7 Camelot Drive, expressed she is upset that Livingston residents were not notified in advance of Mrs. Steffner's resignation and that she is very disappointed with the board.

Mrs. Ferdinand asked if the testing of the air, soil and radon at Burnet Hill will continue without Mrs. Steffner's leadership.

Gwen Samuels, 35 Tiffany Drive, is disheartened by everything that has happened here today. Mrs. Samuels stated the Facebook site is posting details of what is happening right now.

Mrs. Steffner explained we do monitor the number of AP courses students sign up for and try to make sure every student gets every class they want. Mrs. Steffner added we don't limit students on the number they can take unless we see that they have not been successful.

Mrs. Steffner explained Mr. Robinson has been very involved in the testing over at Burnet Hill and she has no doubt that will continue.

Mrs. Steffner will investigate with our attorney whether or not images from the Board of Education can be used on Facebook or other sites.

Mrs. Steffner explained we are closely monitoring the sizes of the kindergarten classes and if we feel it is necessary, we may come to the board asking to add a staff.

Mr. Robinson explained he is confident with the structure we have with the treasurer of school monies and feels it is a waste of money to pay for someone outside the organization to fill that position.

Ms. Messer responded to the comment that there is nothing a board can do if a superintendent elects to resign but in the State of New Jersey, it is typical that an administrator at that level has to give 60 days notice and only if the board elects to have it less than that does it happen faster.

Mr. August added Mrs. Steffner has been a very good superintendent and is sad to see this happen tonight but sometimes there are reasons why it does. Mr. August added he resents the fact that no one is giving respect to the principals, supervisors and teachers who are in the schools every day teaching our children and doing a great job. Mr. August concluded that we will work this out and in the long run, everyone should be happy.

Old Business

There was no Old Business.

New Business

There was no New Business.

ADJOURNMENT

At 9:05 p.m., Mrs. Chirls asked for a motion to go into Executive Session to discuss personnel and that no action will be taken.

Ms. Messer moved the following:

EXECUTIVE SESSION

1. Legal Matters
2. Negotiations
3. Personnel

Whereas, N.J.S.A. 10:4-1 et seq., also known as the "Sunshine Law," authorizes a public body to meet in executive or private session under certain limited circumstances, and

Whereas, said law requires the Board to adopt a resolution at a public hearing before it can meet in such an executive or private session, now, therefore, be it

Resolved, by the Livingston Board of Education that:

(A) It does hereby determine that it is necessary to meet in executive session on July 25, 2018 to discuss the matters stipulated, in conformance with the subsections of said act which are indicated.

1. Matter rendered confidential by federal law, state statute or rule of court.
2. Matter in which the release of information would impair a right to receive federal funds.

3. Matter, the disclosure of which would constitute an unwarranted invasion of individual privacy unless the individual concerned shall request in writing that the same be disclosed publicly.
 4. Collective bargaining matter.
 5. Matter involving the purchase, lease or acquisition of real property with public funds, the setting of banking rates, etc. where it would adversely affect the public interest if discussion were disclosed.
 6. Tactics and techniques utilized in protecting public property where disclosure could impair protection.
 7. Investigation of violations or possible violations of law.
 8. Pending or anticipated litigation or contract negotiation other than collective bargaining agreement.
 9. Personnel matters unless the individual employees or appointees affected requested that such matter be discussed at a public meeting.
 10. Deliberations occurring after a public hearing that may result in the imposition of a specific civil penalty.
- (B) The matters discussed will be made public when confidentiality is no longer required and formal action pursuant to said discussion shall take place only at a meeting to which the public has been invited.
- (C) No action will be taken.

Mrs. Konner seconded the motion.

Vote all in favor.

Respectfully submitted,

Steven K. Robinson
Board Secretary