



## LIVINGSTON BOARD OF EDUCATION VOTING MEETING MINUTES

Monday, January 28, 2019

Executive Session – Administrative Building Large Conference Room – 6:00 p.m.

Public Session –Administrative Building Large Conference Room – 7:00 p.m.

A **Voting Meeting** of the Livingston Board of Education was held on this date in the Administration Building large conference room. The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by the Board President, Charles August, who announced that adequate notice of this meeting has been provided by amendment to notice approved at the Board's reorganization meeting on January 7, 2019 and posted at the Board of Education office and communicated to *The Star Ledger*, *West Essex Tribune*, *TAPinto Livingston* and the Livingston Township Clerk.

Dr. Shen moved the following:

### **Executive Session**

**Whereas**, the Open Public Meetings Act, N.J.S.A. 10:4-11, permits the Board of Education to meet in closed session to discuss certain matters; now, therefore be it

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education adjourns to closed session to discuss:

- Personnel and Legal Settlements

Action may be taken upon return to public session. The full length of the meeting is anticipated to be approximately 60 minutes and be it

**Further Resolved**, the minutes of this closed session be made public when the need for confidentiality no longer exists.

Mrs. Chirls seconded the motion.

Vote all in favor.

At 7:03 p.m., Mr. August reconvened the public meeting.

Members Present: Charles "Buddy" August, Pamela Chirls, Ronnie Konner, Samantha Messer, George Shen and Philippe Jallow

Also in Attendance: James O'Neill, Steven Robinson, Lisa Capone-Steiger, Joann Goldberg and approximately 15 members of the public and staff

## **Superintendent's Report**

Mr. O'Neill called on Mr. Stern to make an announcement about graduation.

Mr. Stern formally invited the board to the Class of 2019 commencement ceremony, which will be held on Thursday, June 20 at 10:30 a.m.

Mr. O'Neill discussed the ongoing concern about the math sequence at Heritage Middle School. Mr. O'Neill explained the issue has to do with students being able to take algebra in middle school so they can follow the sequence that takes them into calculus in their senior year. For students who are unable to take algebra in middle school, they have to double up on math courses in high school to be able to follow the same sequence.

Mr. O'Neill continued they are working on a long term solution through the efforts of the math teachers and supervisors by taking a deep dive into reconfiguring the math program and the sequence of skills needed so more students will be poised to be successful in eighth grade algebra.

Mr. O'Neill continued, in the interim, for this year only, we will offer a one-time opportunity for students in the existing eighth grade in June to take a summer algebra course outside of the high school in order to meet the requirements outlined by the school. These students would be expected to pass the same tests and go through the overall evaluation process as the eighth graders who successfully passed the algebra course at Heritage.

Mr. O'Neill went on to explain he is disturbed about another letter in the paper that insinuates the middle school is nonchalant, lax and less than caring about any incident that might taint of prejudice and discrimination. Mr. O'Neill added this portrayal is not true.

Mr. O'Neill detailed how the district handles such matters and commended the processes the district has in place. With respect to the incident at the middle school, Mr. O'Neill stated an investigation was done, nothing was found and, therefore, nobody was punished. Mr. O'Neill continued to think that the district was supposed to put a notice in the paper that we were worried about an epidemic of discrimination would have been the most inappropriate thing to do. Mr. O'Neill concluded he wanted to be on record stating the insinuations that the administration looked the other way in this incident couldn't be further from the truth.

Mr. O'Neill announced we received a letter from the State advising us that Livingston is 100% compliant with Least Restrictive Environment regulations and commended the staff and Assistant Superintendent Lisa Steiger.

## **Board Member Code of Ethics**

The board read aloud the Board Member Code of Ethics and signed an acknowledgement of same for the Business Administrator.

## **Board Reports**

Mrs. Konner announced the Martin Luther King Jr. celebration that was sponsored by the Livingston Committee on Diversity and Inclusion brought many different groups from the community together to participate in service activities. Mrs. Konner thanked Mrs. Chirls and Dr. Shen for attending.

Dr. Shen announced Lunar New Year is next week and appreciates the school district having a professional development day so that students are off and can participate in activities with their families.

Dr. Shen announced everyone is welcome to join the Chinese community as they celebrate Chinese New Year on February 9 from 3 to 9 p.m. at the high school.

Mrs. Chirls attended the regional chorus concert of which five of our students were represented.

Mr. August attended the Hillside winter concert.

### **Approval of Minutes**

Mrs. Konner moved the following:

1. Voting Meeting Minutes from December 10, 2018
2. Reorganization Meeting Minutes from January 7, 2019
3. Executive Meeting Minutes from September 5, 2018; October 8, 2018; October 15, 2018; October 29, 2018; November 19, 2018; November 26, 2018; December 10, 2018 and January 7, 2019

Dr. Shen seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE** – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Dr. Shen  
Nays – None

### **Public Input on Agenda Items ~ up to 15 minutes**

There was no public input on agenda items.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS FOR APPROVAL**

#### **PROGRAM/CURRICULUM**

Ms. Messer moved the following:

##### **1.1 DVDs**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following DVD as shown on **Attachment A**.

##### **1.2 Agreement with New Jersey Institute of Technology**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the agreement between New Jersey Institute of Technology and Livingston High School for the Options for Advanced Academic Achievement Secondary Partnership Program. This is a dual enrollment program.

##### **1.3 Student Teachers**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following student teacher assignments:

<b>Name</b>	<b>School</b>	<b>Type of Placement</b>	<b>In-District Location</b>	<b>Assigned Staff</b>	<b>Date</b>
Olivia Vollbrecht	Kean University	20 Hour Observation	Burnet Hill	Lara Moskowitz	January 29 - May 15, 2019
Olivia Vollbrecht	Kean University	PreK	Burnet Hill	Tara Freeman	January 29 - May 15, 2019
Deepa Patel	Kean University	Elementary	Burnet Hill	Courtney Ferraro	January 29 - May 15, 2019

Melissa Recarte	Kean University	Middle School ELA	MPM	Nora Yukniewicz	January 29 – May 15, 2019
Janeida Utreras	Kean University	20 Hour Observation	Hillside	Carmela Damante	January 29 – May 15, 2019
Janeida Utreras	Kean University	PreK	Burnet Hill	Loren Svetvilas	January 29 – May 15, 2019
Pedro Liriano	Caldwell University	Music	MPM	Stafford Horne	January 29- May 10, 2019 & September – December 2019
Leonardo Rodriguez	Hudson County Community College	20 Hour Observation	Riker Hill / MPE	Bridget Vasto	January 29 - June 1, 2019

#### **1.4 Educational Leadership Interns**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following individuals to serve as an Educational Leadership Interns in the district:

<u>Intern</u>	<u>Location</u>	<u>Cooperating Administrator</u>	<u>Dates</u>
Tanis Chavanne	LHS	Mark Stern	1/2/19-6/30/19
Adam Berryann	LHS	Bronawyn O’Leary	7/1/19-12/20/19

Mrs. Konner seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE** – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Dr. Shen  
Nays – None

#### **STUDENT SERVICES**

Mrs. Konner moved the following:

##### **2.1 Out of District Placements**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves placement for the academic year 2018-2019 for three (3) Livingston student with disabilities and for Extended School Year 2018 (Summer Programs) for one (1) Livingston student with disabilities, as classified and recommended by the Child Study Team, in facilities with tuition costs to be determined within the limits established by the New Jersey Board of Education as shown on ***Attachment B***.

##### **2.2 Related Services/Medical Consultants**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following consultants that will be utilized to provide related services for the 2018-2019 school year:

#### **AUGMENTATIVE & ALTERNATIVE COMMUNICATION/ASSISTIVE TECHNOLOGY EVALUATIONS**

Cerebral Palsy of North Jersey, ATLAS Division \$995.00/evaluation

Dr. Shen seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE** – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Dr. Shen  
Nays – None

#### **BUSINESS**

Ms. Messer moved the following:

**3.1 Payment of Bills**

**Whereas**, the Board Secretary has audited certain vendor claims as required by N.J.S.A. 18A:19-2 and Board Policy 6470 and presented them to the Livingston Board of Education with the recommendation they be paid, now therefore be it

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the payment of the following bills in the amounts listed and attach a complete copy of these bills to the minutes of this meeting.

<u>Fund</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Amount</u>
10&11	Regular	\$2,443,648.88
12	Regular	313,952.40
20	Regular	164,139.45
60	Cafeteria	<u>632,674.40</u>
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>\$3,554,415.13</u></b>

Regular Checks	79049-79675	\$2,921,740.73
Cafeteria Checks	1077-1090	<u>632,674.40</u>
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>\$3,554,415.13</u></b>

**3.2 Board Secretary Report – November 2018**

**Whereas**, the Livingston Board of Education has received the Report of the Board Secretary for November 30, 2018, consisting of:

- 1) Interim Balance Sheets
- 2) Interim Statements Comparing Budgeted Revenue with Actual to Date and Appropriations with Expenditures and Encumbrances to Date
- 3) Schedule of Revenues - Actual Compared with Estimated
- 4) Statement of Appropriations Compared with Expenditures and encumbrances, and

**Whereas**, the Livingston Board of Education has received the report of the Treasurer for November 30, 2018, which report is in agreement with the Report of the Board Secretary, and

**Whereas**, these reports show the following balances on the date indicated:

	Cash Balance	Appropriation Balance	Fund Balance
(10) General Current Exp. Fund	8,097,935		
(11) Current Expense		11,936,872	3,996,013
(12) Capital Outlay		231,578	1,978,235
(20) Special Revenue Fund	266,150		
(30) Capital Projects Fund	3,144,771		
(40) Debt Service Fund	357,847		
Total:	\$11,866,703	\$12,168,450	\$5,974,248

**Whereas**, pursuant to N.J.A.C. 6:20-212(d), the Board Secretary has certified that as of November 30, 2018, no budgetary line item account has obligations and payments contractual orders which in total exceed the amount appropriated by the district board of education pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:22-8, 18A:22-8.1, now therefore be it

**Resolved**, the Livingston Board of Education accepts the above referenced reports and certification and directs that they be made part of this resolution by reference, and be it

**Further Resolved**, the Livingston Board of Education certifies that, after review of the Secretary's monthly financial report (appropriations section) and upon consultation with the appropriate district officials, to the best of its knowledge no major account or fund has been over-expended in violation of N.J.A.C.6:20-2.13(d) and that sufficient funds are available to meet the district's financial obligations for the remainder of the fiscal year.

### **3.3 Transfers**

**Whereas**, the Superintendent of Schools recommends certain transfers among accounts in the 2018-2019 budget for November pursuant to Board of Education Policy 6422, now therefore be it

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education ratify transfers pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:22-8.1 and N.J.A.C. 6:20-2A.10:

<u>Object</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>To</u>	<u>From</u>
0270	Health Benefits		\$40,000
0420	Clean/Repair Maintenance	\$600	
0512	Cont. Services (Other)	\$10,000	
0600	Supplies and Materials	\$2,175	
0610	General Supplies	\$29,100	
0640	Textbooks		\$1,800
0890	Other Objects		\$75
	TOTALS	\$41,875	\$41,875

### **3.4 Conferences and Overnight Trips**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the conferences and overnight trips as shown on ***Attachment C***.

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves *Lisa Marazzo*, Transportation Manager, to attend the School Transportation Supervisors of NJ Annual Conference from March 27 to 29, 2019 in Atlantic City, NJ, at a cost not to exceed \$550.

### **3.5 Board Member Assignments**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education accepts the president's designation of the following assignments as shown on ***Attachment D***.

### **3.6 New Jersey Schools Insurance Group North Jersey Educational Insurance Fund Indemnity and Trust Agreement – Resolution to Join/Renew Membership**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the renewal of our membership with the New Jersey Schools Insurance Group as shown on **Attachment E**.

**3.7 Settlement Agreements**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the Settlement Agreement for Case #01-19 which is on file at the Board of Education office.

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the Settlement Agreement for Case #02-19 which is on file at the Board of Education office.

**3.8 Change Order**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following change order that has been approved by the architect and construction manager:

<b>FieldTurf USA, Inc. – Livingston High School</b>		
<b>Original Contract</b>		<b>\$456,687.54</b>
Previously approved change orders		<u>0</u>
Contract sum prior to additional change orders		\$456,687.54
Change Order #1 – Remediation work to base at sides lines at Livingston High School.		\$44,154.69
<b>New Contract Sum</b>		<b><u>\$500,842.23</u></b>

Dr. Shen seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE** – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls (abstain check #79399, 79400, 79401), Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Dr. Shen  
 Nays – None

**PERSONNEL**

Ms. Messer moved the following:

**4.1 Resignations**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education accepts the resignations of:

<b>Name</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Reason</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>Last Day of Employment</b>
<i>Deborah Ludwig</i>	Payroll Manager	Retirement	Central Office	July 31, 2019
<i>Lena Ruffin</i>	Bus Driver	Retirement	Transportation	June 30, 2019
<i>Scott Kercher</i>	Supervisor of Social Studies (7-12)	Resignation	HMS/LHS	January 15, 2019
<i>Diane Zambito*</i>	Grade 6 Teacher of Science	Retirement	MPMS	February 28, 2019

<i>Nicole Haslett</i>	Elementary School Teacher	Resignation	RHE	January 31, 2019
<i>Jaime Schultz</i>	Elementary School Teacher	Resignation	BHE	June 30, 2019
<i>Ashley Singewald</i>	Instructional Aide	Resignation	Harrison	January 25, 2019
<i>Mark Brown</i>	Bus Driver	Resignation	Transportation	January 11, 2019

*\*as amended from a previous agenda*

#### 4.2 Leaves of Absences

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the leaves of absences of:

<b>Name</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>LOA w/pay and benefits</b>	<b>LOA w/o pay, but with benefits (if applicable)</b>	<b>Extended LOA w/o pay or benefits</b>	<b>Return Date</b>
<i>Nicole Carangelo</i>	Elementary School Teacher	RHE	2/15/19-4/19/19	4/22/19-6/30/19 & 8/29/19-9/20/19-**	NA	9/23/19
<i>Jessica Rivchin</i>	Teacher of English	LHS	1/18/19-4/3/19	4/4/19-6/30/19**	NA	8/29/19
<i>Jacqueline Kestler</i>	Intervention /Enrichment Specialist	Harrison/BHE	2/25/19-4/19/19**	4/22/19-6/30/19 & 8/29/19-9/19/19**	9/20/19-6/30/2020	9/1/20
<i>Samantha Kowalak</i>	Teacher of Social Studies	LHS	2/26/19-4/19/19	4/22/19-6/30/19**	NA	8/29/19
<i>Kimberly Withers</i>	TOSD	MPE	4/22/19-6/30/19	8/29/19-10/31/19**	NA	11/1/19
<i>Amanda King</i>	Elementary School Teacher	Hillside	4/22/19-6/6/19	6/7/19-11/7/19**	11/8/19-11/15/19	11/18/19
<i>Jenna Graub</i>	TOSD	LHS	2/25/19-4/19/19	4/20/19-5/10/19 & 5/13/19-10/10/19**	10/11/19-6/30/20	9/1/20
<i>Kimberly Colon</i>	Reading Interventionist	RHE	6/7/19-6/30/19	8/29/19-11/20/19**	NA	11/21/19
<i>Stephanie Brunn*</i>	Teacher of ESL	HMS/RHE	10/22/18-12/13/18	12/14/18 - 2/8/19 & 2/11/19-4/5/19**	NA	4/8/19
<i>Kristin Szelingowski*</i>	Elementary School Teacher	Harrison	1/7/19-2/22/19	2/25/19-5/28/19**	NA	5/29/19
<i>Doreen Gugger*</i>	Teacher of ESL	MP Complex	12/3/18-1/15/19	1/16/19-4/10/19**	4/11/19-6/30/19	8/29/19

*\*as amended from a previous agenda*

*\*\*Designates time counted toward NJFLA/FMLA*

#### 4.3 Transfers



**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the transfers as listed on **Attachment F**.

**4.4 Appointments**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the applications indicated below (\*) for emergent hiring for the following appointments under the requirements of N.J.S.A. 18A:16-1 et. seq., N.J.S.A. 18A:39.17 et. seq.; N.J.S.A. 18A:6-4.13 et. seq. All appointments are contingent upon reference checks in accordance with P.L. 2018, c.5.

Name	Location	Title	Tenure Track/LOA or LT Replacement	Replacing	Guide	Step	Salary	Effective Date
<i>Clark Murphy</i>	RHE	Elementary School Teacher	Leave Replacement	Nicole Haslett/Nicole Carangelo	MA+32	1	\$65,326	1/15/19
<i>Jill McLaughlin**</i>	RHE	Elementary School Teacher	Full Year Leave Replacement	Melissa Rosario/Nicole Haslett	BA	2	\$53,119	8/29/18
<i>Lovely Stphard</i>	Transportation	25 Hr Bus Driver	NA	Mark Brown	25 hr BD	5	\$23,626 (pro-rated)	1/14/19
<i>Sumi Pillai</i>	RHE	Playground Aide	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$15.50/hr	12/20/18
<i>Kayla Choi</i>	RHE	Playground Aide	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$15.50/hr	1/10/19

*\*begins 60-day probationary period  
\*\*as amended from previous agenda*

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education reflects *Annette Ferreira's* start date at Central Office to be January 2, 2019.

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the appointment of the ABA Discrete Trial TA's and Instructional Aides as listed on **Attachment G**.

**4.5 Substitutes**

Name	Location	Title	Leave Replacement or Long Term Sub	Replacing	Salary	Effective Date
<i>Daniel Calligaro</i>	HMS	Teacher of Science	Long Term Substitute	Christopher Russoniello	\$263/day	1/2/19

**Teachers**

*Melina Sampaio  
Rebecca Leshchinsky  
Casey Friedman  
Sheri-Lynn Jamison  
Amanda Bassano  
Elizabeth Conklin  
Cara Greenspan  
Phillip Johnson*

**Custodial**

*Ryan Braddock (\$15.50/hr)*

**Secretarial**

*Stacey Kaplan (\$16.00/hr)*

#### **4.6 Extra Work Pay**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following payments as listed on **Attachment H** for work performed.

#### **4.7 Stipends**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the Livingston High School Athletic Stipends as listed on **Attachment I**.

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the individual on **Attachment J** for co-curricular stipends at Heritage Middle School in accordance with the contract between the LBOE and the LEA.

#### **4.8 Longevity**

**Resolved**, that the Board approves the individuals on **Addendum K** for longevity effective February 1, 2019.

#### **4.9 Extra Period Assignments**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the individual listed on **Attachment L** for extra period assignments in accordance with the contract between the LBOE and the LEA.

#### **4.10 Contract Adjustments**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the contract adjustment as listed on **Attachment M**.

#### **4.11 Mentor Fees**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the individuals on **Attachment N** listed as assigned mentors to receive payment in accordance with the schedule listed.

Dr. Shen seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE** – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Dr. Shen  
Nays – None

### **MISCELLANEOUS**

Dr. Shen moved the following:

#### **5.1 HIB Report**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education accepts the findings of HIB cases.

#### **5.2 Suspension Report**

**Resolved**, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the Suspension Report for the month of December.

Mrs. Konner seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE** – Ayes – Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mrs. Konner, Ms. Messer, Dr. Shen  
Nays – None

**Public Comment ~ up to 15 minutes**

Sasha Koff, 13 Rumson Road, asked the board to revisit policy #0168 on recording board meetings to make the public meetings more accessible rather than waiting a few days after it is recorded to be posted online.

Mrs. Koff asked that the AP class load and scheduling be looked at before getting into the wait list situation that happened last year.

Mrs. Koff asked for clarification if any additional public input will be taken with regard to the superintendent search.

Mrs. Koff announced an event that is co-sponsored by LHS and LMAC entitled *Hidden in Plain Sight* will be occurring this Thursday, January 31<sup>st</sup>. The program addresses substance abuse.

Mrs. Koff attended an event held last week that was hosted by Mrs. Steiger called a Book Tasting Night that taught parents how to pick books for your children.

Mr. August announced the Cycle for Survival event will be held on February 2.

Irena Brekman, 21 Mountain Ridge Drive, has an eighth grade child and has concerns about the math sequence but Mr. O'Neill addressed them at the beginning of the meeting. Mrs. Brekman asked how parents will be notified of the change and Mr. O'Neill answered a memo with clear guidelines is being drafted and will be sent out to parents.

Sage Blinderman, 18 East Drive, suggested we be careful about pushing kids before their ready to get into algebra.

Mike Ramer, 22 Mohawk Drive, asked for an update on the superintendent search.

Mr. O'Neill responded we have had over 40 applications, they have all been screened and a number was arrived at being appropriate to interview. Mr. O'Neill added the speed of the process is dependent upon how many people are interviewed, the number of times, and the coordination of everyone's schedules to allow all to be involved. Mr. O'Neill anticipates a resolution coming sometime in the month of February and because most sitting superintendents have to give 60 to 90 days' notice, the advertised start date is July 1<sup>st</sup>.

Mr. August thanked all of the retirees for their service.

**Old Business**

There was no old business.

**New Business**

There was no new business.

**ADJOURNMENT**

At 7:40 p.m., Mr. August asked for a motion to go into Executive Session to discuss the superintendent search and that no action will be taken.

Mrs. Konner moved the following:

**EXECUTIVE SESSION**

1. Legal Matters
2. Negotiations
3. Personnel

**Whereas**, N.J.S.A. 10:4-1 et seq., also known as the “Sunshine Law,” authorizes a public body to meet in executive or private session under certain limited circumstances, and

**Whereas**, said law requires the Board to adopt a resolution at a public hearing before it can meet in such an executive or private session, now, therefore, be it

**Resolved**, by the Livingston Board of Education that:

- (A) It does hereby determine that it is necessary to meet in executive session on January 28, 2019 to discuss the matters stipulated, in conformance with the subsections of said act which are indicated.
1. Matter rendered confidential by federal law, state statute or rule of court.
  2. Matter in which the release of information would impair a right to receive federal funds.
  3. Matter, the disclosure of which would constitute an unwarranted invasion of individual privacy unless the individual concerned shall request in writing that the same be disclosed publicly.
  4. Collective bargaining matter.
  5. Matter involving the purchase, lease or acquisition of real property with public funds, the setting of banking rates, etc. where it would adversely affect the public interest if discussion were disclosed.
  6. Tactics and techniques utilized in protecting public property where disclosure could impair protection.
  7. Investigation of violations or possible violations of law.
  8. Pending or anticipated litigation or contract negotiation other than collective bargaining agreement.
  9. Personnel matters unless the individual employees or appointees affected requested that such matter be discussed at a public meeting.
  10. Deliberations occurring after a public hearing that may result in the imposition of a specific civil penalty.
- (B) The matters discussed will be made public when confidentiality is no longer required and formal action pursuant to said discussion shall take place only at a meeting to which the public has been invited.
- (C) No action will be taken.

Dr. Shen seconded the motion.

Vote all in favor.

**Respectfully submitted,**

---

**Steven K. Robinson**  
**Board Secretary**