



LIVINGSTON BOARD OF EDUCATION VOTING MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, August 12, 2020

Executive Session - Virtual Meeting Via Zoom - 6:30 p.m.

Public Session - Virtual Meeting Via Zoom and Facebook Live – 7:30 p.m.

A **Voting Meeting** of the Livingston Board of Education was held on this date via Zoom and Facebook Live. The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. by the Board President, Ronnie Konner, who announced that adequate notice of this meeting has been provided by amendment to notice approved at the Board's reorganization meeting on January 7, 2020 and posted at the Board of Education office and communicated to *The Star Ledger*, *West Essex Tribune*, *TAPinto Livingston* and the Livingston Township Clerk.

Ms. Messer moved the following:

Executive Session

Whereas, the Open Public Meetings Act, N.J.S.A. 10:4-11, permits the Board of Education to meet in closed session to discuss certain matters; now, therefore be it

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education adjourns to closed session to discuss:

- Legal Issue

Action may be taken upon return to public session. The full length of the meeting is anticipated to be approximately 60 minutes and be it

Further Resolved, the minutes of this closed session be made public when the need for confidentiality no longer exists.

Mrs. Chirls seconded the motion.

Vote all in favor.

At 7:33 p.m., Mrs. Konner reconvened the public session.

Members Present: Charles "Buddy" August, Pamela Chirls, Seth Cohen, Ronnie Konner, Samantha Messer and Aditya Desai

Also in Attendance: Dr. Matthew Block, Steven Robinson, Lisa Capone-Steiger, Susan Burman and Joann Goldberg

There were approximately 350 members of the public and staff watching remotely via a Facebook Live stream.

Mr. Aditya Desai led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Superintendent's Report

Dr. Block explained the Governor made an announcement today that may create significant changes to the process of opening schools across the state. Dr. Block added there is no way for us to fully assess the impact of today's announcement until we see the Executive Order in writing and have been advised by legal counsel not to submit our current hybrid plan until we know more about what the order entails.

Dr. Block continued we are still moving forward with our plans but heard the feedback on Monday and are relooking at some of the aspects of our plan in response to that feedback.

Dr. Block also explained that the Governor today did not indicate schools could not reopen. He indicated there will be a process for school districts who may be encountering legitimate, documented reasons why they cannot reopen. We await additional guidance as to what all of this means and will move forward accordingly.

Board Reports

Mrs. Konner announced the questions and answers from the last meeting are available on our website.

Mrs. Konner announced some of the board members attended a meeting of Essex and Hudson County School Boards where those county superintendents attempted to answer some questions with regard to reopening plans.

Approval of Minutes

Mr. Cohen moved the following:

1. Public Portion of Executive Session Meeting Minutes of July 7, 2020
2. Voting Meeting Minutes of July 15, 2020
3. Public Portion of Executive Session Meeting Minutes of August 3, 2020

Ms. Messer seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE - Ayes - Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mr. Cohen, Ms. Messer, Mrs. Konner
Nayes - None

Public Input on Agenda Items ~ up to 15 minutes

Juan Quintero, 119 Hillside, suggested we don't rush kids out of the house and take a step back and look at the entirety of the situation.

Michele Cohen, 15 Woodland Terrace, asked if the surveys will still be coming out on August 14 asking parents to choose the hybrid or all remote model in light of the Governor's announcement today. Mrs. Cohen asked if full details of the all remote plan will be released the week of August 17 which seems to be after parents have made their choice. Mrs. Cohen clarified parents are really making the decision they want to send their kids back to school because the two plans are providing basically the same education.

Dr. Block explained that yes, the full remote and hybrid plans are aligned to provide the same instruction and schedule. The questionnaire is to determine whether you are sending your child into school or keeping them remote for the in-person instructional time. Dr. Block continued

that the secondary plan that we are sending out next week is the full virtual plan for the district. This is the plan we will follow if the district has to go fully remote.

Dr. Block continued that due to the Governor's announcement, if we need to postpone asking families the choice question, we will send out notification to all families tomorrow.

Jeri Fitzgerald, 35 South Mitchell Avenue, asked how many teachers in the district said they will not return to the classroom because of coronavirus concerns?

Dr. Block explained we have asked teachers to indicate to us if they have an issue returning in the fall and the Human Resources office is working with each of these individuals to help them assess their situation and what their options are moving forward.

Pam Kalish, 69 Cornell Drive, asked what happens to elementary students who were unable to learn remotely in the spring? What will happen to the students this year if we go remote? Will they need to repeat a year of their education? How will we help with those who are suffering emotionally, socially and academically?

Dr. Block responded that when we release our fully remote learning plan next week, if we need to go fully remote, parents will see a new learning plan that was put together based on feedback from focus groups, the surveys, reflection on the three months of remote learning experience from the spring and multiple restart committees. In addition, we have opened up a professional development portal to offer more professional development on remote learning to staff before school starts.

Michele Cohen, 15 Woodland Terrace, if there are two siblings in different schools and one is staying home because of concerns relating to COVID, is there some way to track and make sure the other sibling also stays home?

Dr. Block responded that each district, as part of *The Road Back*, is responsible for implementing a contact tracing program. We track student attendance and will be able to monitor so if one student is home, there is a good chance the other would have to quarantine.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR APPROVAL

PROGRAM/CURRICULUM

There was no motion.

STUDENT SERVICES

Mr. August moved the following:

2.1 Out of District Placement

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves placement for the academic year 2020-2021 for five (5) Livingston students with disabilities and for Extended School Year 2020 (Summer Programs) for four (4) Livingston students with disabilities, as classified and recommended by the Child Study Team, in facilities with tuition costs to be determined within the limits established by the New Jersey Board of Education as shown on **Attachment A**.

Mr. Cohen seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE - Ayes - Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mr. Cohen, Ms. Messer, Mrs. Konner
 Nays - None

BUSINESS

Mrs. Konner stated we are adding Resolution 3.7, which is the addition of a board meeting to the calendar on August 19.

Mr. August moved 3.1 to 3.7:

3.1 Payment of Bills

Whereas, the Board Secretary has audited certain vendor claims as required by N.J.S.A. 18A:19-2 and Board Policy 6470 and presented them to the Livingston Board of Education with the recommendation they be paid, now therefore be it

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the payment of the following bills in the amounts listed and attach a complete copy of these bills to the minutes of this meeting.

Fund	Name	Amount
10&11	Regular	1,610,705.27
12	Regular	14,899.85
20	Regular	264,302.26
60	Cafeteria	1,583.99
	TOTAL	<u>\$1,891,491.37</u>

Regular Checks	86502-88128	1,889,907.38
Cafeteria	1197-1233	1,583.99
	TOTAL	<u>\$1,891,491.37</u>

3.2 Board Secretary Report – June 2020

Whereas, the Livingston Board of Education has received the Report of the Board Secretary for June 30, 2020, consisting of:

- 1) Interim Balance Sheets
- 2) Interim Statements Comparing Budgeted Revenue with Actual to Date and Appropriations with Expenditures and Encumbrances to Date
- 3) Schedule of Revenues - Actual Compared with Estimated
- 4) Statement of Appropriations Compared with Expenditures and encumbrances, and

Whereas, the Livingston Board of Education has received the report of the Treasurer for June 30, 2020, which report is in agreement with the Report of the Board Secretary, and

Whereas, these reports show the following balances on the date indicated:

	Cash Balance	Appropriation Balance	Fund Balance
(10) General Current Exp. Fund	10,097,985		
(11) Current Expense		3,507,988	4,946,969
(12) Capital Outlay		30,966	1,978,235
(20) Special Revenue Fund	15		

(30) Capital Projects Fund	4,183,309		
(40) Debt Service Fund	295,962		
Total:	\$14,577,271	\$3,538,954	\$6,925,204

Whereas, pursuant to N.J.A.C. 6:20-212(d), the Board Secretary has certified that as of June 30, 2020, no budgetary line item account has obligations and payments contractual orders which in total exceed the amount appropriated by the district board of education pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:22-8, 18A:22-8.1, now therefore be it

Resolved, the Livingston Board of Education accepts the above referenced reports and certification and directs that they be made part of this resolution by reference, and be it

Further Resolved, the Livingston Board of Education certifies that, after review of the Secretary’s monthly financial report (appropriations section) and upon consultation with the appropriate district officials, to the best of its knowledge no major account or fund has been over-expended in violation of N.J.A.C.6:20-2.13(d) and that sufficient funds are available to meet the district’s financial obligations for the remainder of the fiscal year.

3.3 Transfers

Whereas, the Superintendent of Schools recommends certain transfers among accounts in the 2019-2020 budget for June pursuant to Board of Education Policy 6422, now therefore be it

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education ratify transfers pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:22-8.1 and N.J.A.C. 6:20-2A.10:

<u>Object</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>To</u>	<u>From</u>
0270	Health Benefits		\$37,306
0561	Transfer of Funds to Charter School	\$37,306	
	TOTALS	\$37,306	\$37,306

3.4 Conferences and Overnight Trips

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the virtual conference as shown on **Attachment B**.

3.5 State Aid Adjustment

Resolved, pursuant to N.J.A.C. 6A:23A-13.3, the Livingston Board of Education is reducing the appropriations in the amount of \$541,611 for the reduction in 2020-2021 State Aid. The reduction will be taken from account number 11-000-261-890-7074-12.

3.6 Policies and Regulations

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following policies and regulations for first reading:

Program

Policy #2622 - Student Assessment (M) (revised)

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following policies for second reading and adoption:

Administration

Policy #1649 - Federal Families First Coronavirus (COVID-19) Response Act (M) (new to district)

Students

Policy #5111 - Eligibility of Resident/Non-Resident Students (M) (revised)

Regulation #5111 - Eligibility of Resident/Non-Resident Students (M) (revised)

3.7 Addition of LBOE Meeting

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the addition of a voting meeting to be held on Wednesday, August 19, 2020 to the board’s Annual Meeting Calendar that was previously approved on January 7, 2020. An executive session will be held at 6:00 p.m. followed by a public voting meeting at 8:00 p.m.

Ms. Messer seconded the motion.

Mrs. Burman confirmed Policy 1649 was updated since the first reading to address Mrs. Chirl’s question.

Mr. Robinson explained the board was proactive in putting funds aside during the budget process and the account that was identified at that time is where the State aid reduction was taken from.

ROLL CALL VOTE - Ayes - Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mr. Cohen, Ms. Messer, Mrs. Konner
Nayes - None

PERSONNEL

Ms. Messer moved the following:

4.1 Resignations

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education accepts the resignations of:

Name	Position	Reason	Location	Last Day of Employment
<i>Danielle Stecki</i>	Instructional Aide	Resignation	Collins	6/30/2020
<i>Briana Belostock</i>	Elementary School Teacher	Resignation	BHE	8/6/2020
<i>Patricia Christiano</i>	Instructional Aide	Resignation	LHS	8/6/2020

**as amended from a previous agenda*

4.2 Leaves of Absences

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the leaves of absences of:

Name	Position	Location	LOA w/pay and benefits	LOA w/o pay, but with	Extended LOA w/o pay or benefits	Return Date

				benefits (if applicable)		
<i>Jennifer Torres*</i>	Teacher of English	LHS	9/1/2020-9/7/2020	9/8/2020-12/1/2020**	12/2/2020-1/8/2021	1/11/2021
<i>Amelia Rieth</i>	Intervention/Enrichment Specialist	Collins	1/4/2021-3/10/2021	3/11/2021-6/10/2021**	6/11/2021-6/30/2021	8/30/2021

**as amended from a previous agenda*

***Designates time counted toward NJFLA/FMLA*

4.3 Appointments

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the applications indicated below (*) for emergent hiring for the following appointments under the requirements of N.J.S.A. 18A:16-1 et. seq., N.J.S.A. 18A:39.17 et. seq.; N.J.S.A. 18A:6-4.13 et. seq. All appointments are contingent upon reference checks in accordance with P.L. 2018, c.5.

Name	Location	Title	Tenure Track/LOA or LT Replacement	Replacing	Guide	Step	Salary	Effective Date
<i>Scott Rahner</i>	Hillside	TOSD	One Year Leave Replacement	P. Price	BA	1	\$52,673*	9/1/2020
<i>Stacy Santola</i>	Hillside	Elementary School Teacher	One Year Leave Replacement	A. Hinds	MA	1	\$59,803	9/1/2020
<i>Kathleen Custer</i>	Collins	Elementary School Teacher	First Year Tenure Track	New	BA	2**	\$53,278*	9/1/2020
<i>Jessica Reid***</i>	Hillside	Elementary School Teacher	One Year Leave Replacement	J. Kestler	BA+16	1	\$54,560*	9/1/2020
<i>Kelly Egan</i>	Harrison	Elementary School Teacher	First Year Tenure Track	new	BA+16	2	\$55,179*	9/1/2020
<i>Ann DeFazio</i>	LHS	Teacher of Biology	First Year Tenure Track	S. Spadafina	MA+32	11	\$87,879*	9/1/2020

**all salaries after 7/1/2020 may be adjusted in accordance with contract negotiations*

***will remain at the same step in 2020-2021 in accordance with Article X, Section II.C. of the LEA contract*

****as amended from a previous agenda*

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the renewals, transfers and appointments of the ABA Discrete Trial TA's and Instructional Aides as listed on **Attachment C***.

**all salaries after 7/1/2020 may be adjusted in accordance with contract negotiations*

4.4 Substitutes

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves *Lois Kaplan* as substitute secretary on an as-needed basis for the 2020-2021 school year at an hourly rate of \$17.50.

4.5 Summer Work

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the individuals on **Attachment D** to work over the summer of 2020 at the request of the Assistant Superintendent to assist with sports physicals at their hourly or per diem rate*.

**the rate may be adjusted in accordance with contract negotiations*

4.6 Stipends & Coaching Staff

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the individuals on **Attachment E** as Strength and Conditioning Coaches for the NJSIAA Phase I Summer Two-Week Conditioning Session from July 13, 2020 to July 24, 2020, at the hourly rate listed, not to exceed 10 hours each.

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the individuals listed on **Attachment F** as volunteer coaches while we are in the virtual practice period for the athletic season in accordance with NJSIAA regulations.

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves *Ylli Alliu* for the HVAC Certification stipend of \$600 for obtaining his HVAC certification, effective August 1, 2020.

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the individuals on **Attachment G** for co-curricular stipends at Livingston High School for the 2020-2021 school year in accordance with the contract between the LBOE and the LEA.

4.7 Job Description

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the following job description:

ESL Coordinator (stipend)

4.8 Memorandum of Understanding

Resolved, that the Livingston Board of Education approves the MOU re: coaching stipends with the LEA dated August 12, 2020.

Mr. Cohen seconded the motion.

Mrs. Chirls asked on agenda items 4.1, 4.2 and 4.3, if there are any circumstances related to concerns about COVID.

Mrs. Burman responded we cannot answer personnel questions in public session.

Mr. Cohen asked if we have confirmed that whatever our return to school model may be, there is a role and need for the individuals listed under Resolution 4.3 and Mrs. Burman responded, yes.

Mrs. Konner asked for an explanation on the hiring of new positions and Mrs. Burman responded they were authorized at Collins and Harrison due to higher expected enrollment in certain grades.

Mr. Robinson will provide an enrollment update at the next meeting.

Mrs. Chirls asked if the job description is for a position that is being filled and Mrs. Burman responded that yes, it is for a position being filled and with the appointment of our new World Language and ESL Supervisor, we wanted to codify what the role of the ESL Coordinator would be in writing and have it approved by the board.

Mrs. Konner added that previously in that department we had either a lead teacher or this position. Mrs. Konner asked with the new supervisor having expertise in this, is it at his request to have this position or did we look at the lead teacher model that the other K-12 departments use.

Mrs. Burman will find out the answer before the position is filled.

ROLL CALL VOTE - Ayes - Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls (on 4.4-4.8), Mr. Cohen, Ms. Messer,
Mrs. Konner
Nayes - Mrs. Chirls (on 4.1, 4.2 and 4.3)

Public Comment ~ up to 15 minutes

David Sussman, 11 Consul Road, asked why general trends for staff cannot be disclosed.

Dr. Block explained we have had over 90 employees inquire about options available to them who may have some type of issue. Right now they are inquiries and we are working with them on an individual basis to help them assess their situation and what their options are moving forward.

Spencer and Helene Korn, 7 Cherry Hill Road, asked what the guidelines are for moving between the phases. When do we move from phase 1 to phase 2 to phase 3, etc.

Dr. Block explained we are still officially developing the guidelines which include looking at public health issues, change in status of the virus, the students ability to comply with reopening guidelines and health screening logs. As those items are assessed, we will look to move phases.

Laura Lee, 231 Walnut Street, wrote if we opt for full virtual, is it synchronous learning with the same teacher teaching students in the classroom at the same time or is it a dedicated teacher to just the virtual students?

Dr. Block explained the teacher will teach the virtual and in-person students simultaneously, sometimes synchronously and sometimes asynchronously. Dr. Block suggested looking at the Q&A document that was posted on our website for more information.

Rachel Brant, 3 Dorien Road, given that Dr. Block said the full remote learning plan is more robust than hybrid at the secondary level and the elementary program seems better spent in hybrid, please speak to the possibility of keeping elementary at a hybrid level and moving secondary to full remote.

Jeri Fitzgerald, 35 South Mitchell Avenue, asked what the specific day-to-day teaching and learning differences are for a student who chooses full remote (5 days remote) and for a student who chooses hybrid (1 day in school and 4 days remote) or will they be exactly the same? Mrs. Fitzgerald also asked if full remote students and hybrid remote students have the same teachers?

Dr. Block explained the scheduled day is a little longer in full remote because you don't have arrival and dismissal and students moving from school to home for lunch. Dr. Block continued that other than being in person or being hybrid, yes, they will be on the same page. Every day a minimum of 50% of our students will be remote. It will be important for our teachers to pay equal attention to the students who are remote and the students who are in full time.

Debbie Schragar, 13 Maplewood Drive asked if it is possible to mix live lessons from teachers with lessons found on the internet with assignments that students can do on their own. Mrs. Schragar asked if we could separate remote students for teachers who will not be returning and have them teach the same curriculum at the same pace as those in the hybrid class instead of letting them retire or take family medical leave? Mrs. Schragar asked how hybrid and remote students will be able to be in the same class. What are the benefits for doing this? Won't it be confusing for the teacher and the students? Have we

tested how this will work? Couldn't we separate the two and just ensure they are being taught the same material at the same pace?

Dr. Block responded it is difficult to line up teachers with students who both want to be remote but we are looking at any way we can to engage teachers. Dr. Block continued having hybrid and remote students in the same class will be a new paradigm but our teachers are very talented and we will work with them to help adjust to this new model.

Mrs. Schrage also asked how breaking up the students alphabetically changes the way the students are assembled for classes. Does that mean that some students will not be as challenged and others would struggle more? Mrs. Schrage asked if kids are remote, how easy will it be for them to go into hybrid learning? If they had to change teachers to do this, how will this work? How will students with an IEP that get aide assistance in science and social studies receive that extra help if working remotely? Could they reinforce the lessons with the students instead of their parents?

Dr. Block responded we hope all students will be equally challenged and will work to make sure all student's needs are met. Dr. Block continued that moving in and out of the hybrid plan should be seamless but will be an adjustment in the beginning. Dr. Block continued our aides will be engaged with students through the same means, either in school or remotely, and all students will receive the services that are provided for in their IEP.

Vicenza DeFeo, 10 Hepworth Street, is a bus aide in Livingston and asked if we have any information about their contracts.

Mrs. Burman responded bus aides will be on the next agenda for approval.

Lisa Heumann, 9 Stoney Hill Place, asked if students will be responsible for taking the NJSLA this year if we are hybrid or remote. When incoming 9th grades are expected to drop off their 8th grade computers and receive new ones? How will the district keep bathrooms clean throughout the day, will they be monitoring them and limiting how many people go inside and do the bathrooms have windows or proper ventilation? How will classrooms be cleaned between classes at the high school?

Dr. Block responded we don't know yet if students will have to take the NJSLA this year. Dr. Block continued that parents will receive a communication within the next week or so from each principal about items specific to their buildings and about devices.

Dr. Block encouraged everyone to read the Q&A document that was put out for more information on cleaning and monitoring bathrooms, hallways and classrooms.

Old Business

There was no old business.

New Business

There was no new business.

ADJOURNMENT

At 8:28 p.m., Mrs. Konner made a motion to go into Executive Session stating no action will be taken and the board will not be coming back into public session.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. August moved the following:

- 1. Legal Matters
- 2. Negotiations
- 3. Personnel

Whereas, N.J.S.A. 10:4-1 et seq., also known as the "Sunshine Law," authorizes a public body to meet in executive or private session under certain limited circumstances, and

Whereas, said law requires the Board to adopt a resolution at a public hearing before it can meet in such an executive or private session, now, therefore, be it

Resolved, by the Livingston Board of Education that:

- (A) It does hereby determine that it is necessary to meet in executive session on August 12, 2020 to discuss the matters stipulated, in conformance with the subsections of said act which are indicated.
 - 1. Matter rendered confidential by federal law, state statute or rule of court.
 - 2. Matter in which the release of information would impair a right to receive federal funds.
 - 3. Matter, the disclosure of which would constitute an unwarranted invasion of individual privacy unless the individual concerned shall request in writing that the same be disclosed publicly.
 - 4. Collective bargaining matter.
 - 5. Matter involving the purchase, lease or acquisition of real property with public funds, the setting of banking rates, etc. where it would adversely affect the public interest if discussion were disclosed.
 - 6. Tactics and techniques utilized in protecting public property where disclosure could impair protection.
 - 7. Investigation of violations or possible violations of law.
 - 8. Pending or anticipated litigation or contract negotiation other than collective bargaining agreement.
 - 9. Personnel matters unless the individual employees or appointees affected requested that such matter be discussed at a public meeting.
 - 10. Deliberations occurring after a public hearing that may result in the imposition of a specific civil penalty.
- (B) The matters discussed will be made public when confidentiality is no longer required and formal action pursuant to said discussion shall take place only at a meeting to which the public has been invited.
- (C) No action will be taken.

Mrs. Chirls seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE - Ayes - Mr. August, Mrs. Chirls, Mr. Cohen, Ms. Messer, Mrs. Konner
Nayes - None

Respectfully submitted,



Steven K. Robinson
Board Secretary